



**City Of Kingston
Heritage Kingston
Meeting Number 05-2018
Minutes
Wednesday May 16, 2018 at 9:30 a.m.
Council Chamber, City Hall**

Committee Members Present

Councillor Peter Stroud; Chair
Mac Gervan
Catherine Hyett
Jane McFarlane
Hailey Smith
Donald Taylor

Regrets

Councillor Schell
Paul Carl

Staff Members Present

Ms. Agnew, Director, Planning, Building & Licensing
Ms. Campbell, Manager, Cultural Heritage
Ms. Fossitt, Manager, Cultural Marketing
Mr. Leary, Senior Planner
Mr. Newman, Manager, Policy Planning
Ms. Rowse-Thompson, Planner
Mr. Thompson, Committee Clerk

Others Present

Members of the Public were present

Meeting to Order

The Chair called the meeting to order at 9:38 a.m.

Approval of the Agenda

Moved by Mr. Taylor
Seconded by Ms. McFarlane

That the agenda be approved

Carried

Confirmation of Minutes

Moved by Mr. Taylor
Seconded by Ms. Hyett

That the Minutes of Heritage Kingston Meeting Number 04-2018 held Wednesday April 18, 2018 be approved.

Carried

Disclosure of Pecuniary Interest

Mr. Gervan declared a pecuniary interest regarding 92 Sydenham Street as he has conducted business with the applicant in the past.

Delegations

There were none.

Presentations

There were none.

Briefings

- a) Ms. Fossitt, Manager, Cultural Marketing was present to speak to the Committee regarding 19-27 Brock Street, 230 Ontario Street and 38-40 Princess Street.

Ms. Fossitt conducted a PowerPoint presentation regarding 19-27 Brock Street, 230 Ontario Street and 38-40 Princess Street. A copy of the PowerPoint presentation is attached to the original set of minutes located in the City Clerk's Department.

Councillor Stroud sought further information regarding the style of artwork being displayed. Ms. Fossitt responded that the Arts Advisory Committee will review the art to ensure that is in keeping with the setting. She mentioned that the art panels will be rotated and portable to

allow for use in other locations. Councillor Stroud commented that the art should be compatible with Market Square.

Ms. McFarlane sought further information regarding the composition of the jury. Ms. Fossitt spoke to the Public Art Policy and provided the Committee with information regarding the mandate of the Public Art Working Group.

Business

- a) Cultural Heritage**
- b) Policy Development and Implementation**
- c) Heritage Assets**
 - i. Pump House Steam Museum**
 - ii. MacLachlan Woodworking Museum**
- d) Statutory Business**
 - i. Subject: Application for Heritage Permit**
Address: 1401 Highway 2 (P18-002)
File Number: P18-029-2018

Mr. Leary provided the Committee with a summary of the Report.

Mr. Zaback provided a PowerPoint presentation regarding 1401 Highway 2.

Mr. Gervan sought further information regarding the foundation. The agent provided the Committee with additional information regarding the condition of the foundation. Mr. Leary explained that the ring foundation would remain in place as would the dirt floor.

Mr. Taylor stated that ideally it is preferred to disturb the building less than what is proposed in the application. He suggested that other less intrusive repair options be considered. He stated that it is inappropriate for the Committee to approve an extreme solution without having significant information regarding alternative approaches. Mr. Unsworth stated that staff intended to develop a flexible plan. He indicated that staff would like to reconstruct the building for the long term with a maintenance free solution. He noted that the north and east walls need to be fully reconstructed. He indicated that a decision regarding the repair approach will need to be made as the project unfolds.

Councillor Stroud reiterated that the agent and staff will make a decision at a later date. He indicated that the recommendation provides staff with flexibility to address the repairs as deemed necessary.

Mr. Leary noted that the recommendation provides the option to either repair or completely rebuild the structure. He clarified that the property will be restored to its original condition by whatever means necessary.

The Chair afforded members of the public with an opportunity to provide comment.

Mr. Gower commented that the application is a fascinating project. He suggested that the Committee receive an information report regarding the outcome of the project.

Mr. Taylor expressed concern regarding the recommendation and indicated that the Committee should be provided additional information as they are being asked to make a decision which impacts the heritage value of the property. He indicated that the proposed solution is not the gold standard for heritage conservation. He commented that while he appreciates the desire to limit repairing the building moving forward a gentler solution should be considered. He indicated that the Committee should consider a less costly approach which requires some maintenance every five to ten years. He indicated that the interior walls appear quite solid.

Mr. Gervan stated that he is in agreement that it is not efficient to be required to repair the building every five years. He commented that he is supportive of the recommendation. He indicated that a proper foundation would make the building structurally sound.

Councillor Stroud requested that Mr. Taylor assume the role of Chair.

Councillor Stroud noted that Mr. Taylor has spoken to the value of a fully reconstructed vault. He mentioned that the Committee could defer this matter to receive additional information regarding cost estimates.

The Committee recessed.

Moved by Mr. Gervan
Seconded by Ms. Hyett

That alterations to the property at 1401 Highway 2, be approved in accordance with the details described in the application (File Number P18-029-2018), which was deemed completed on April 19, 2018, with said alterations to include the repair and/or full reconstruction of the stone former storage vault with the understanding that repair is the preferred option and that reconstruction be considered as a last resort; and

That the approval of the alterations be subject to the following conditions:

1. A Building Permit shall be obtained, if necessary;
2. All masonry works shall be completed in accordance with the City's Policy on Masonry Restoration on Heritage Buildings; and
3. The repaired/reconstructed building shall match the existing in form and detailing; and

That staff provide a report to Heritage Kingston regarding the outcome of the project.

**Carried As Amended
See Motion to Amend which Carried**

Moved by Councillor Stroud
Seconded by Mr. Gervan

That the recommendation of Mr. Gervan and Ms. Hyett regarding 1401 Highway 2 be amended by inserting the following phrase to the end of the first clause:

“with the understanding that repair is the preferred option and that reconstruction be considered as a last resort; and”;

That the recommendation be further amended to include a third clause which reads as follows:

“**That** staff provide a report to Heritage Kingston regarding the outcome of the project.”

Carried

Councillor Stroud resumed the role of Chair.

- ii. **Subject: Application for Heritage Permit**
Address: 5509 Highway 15 (P18-003)
File Number: P18-028-2018

Ms. Rowse-Thompson provided the Committee with an overview of the Report.

Mr. Gervan sought further information regarding the structural support associated with the upper windows. The applicant informed the Committee that a voussoir is supporting the bricks beneath the windows. He elaborated that the bricks are not supported by anything other than mortar. He stated that the stone mason intends to remove the cracked bricks and repair the sills. Mr. Gervan questioned if the mason felt that additional support was necessary. The applicant responded that the mason believes that the voussoirs were damaged when the soffit was removed from the chimney. Mr. Gervan suggested that white oak be considered for the sills.

The Chair afforded members of the public with an opportunity to provide comment.

Members of the public did not provide comment.

Mr. Taylor commented that the repairs to the brickwork are quite substantial. He encouraged the applicant to request a detailed report from the mason.

Moved by Mr. Gervan
Seconded by Mr. Taylor

That it is recommended to Council that alterations to the property at 5509 Highway 15, be approved in accordance with the details described in the application (File Number P18-028-2018), which was deemed complete on April 9, 2018, with said demolition of the rear wood frame addition; extensive brick repair and repointing; demolition of the exterior cement block chimney and alterations to the garage/drive shed including a new black metal roof, board and batten wood siding, new garage doors and new entrance door; and

That the approval of the alterations be subject to the following conditions:

1. A Building Permit shall be obtained;
2. All masonry works shall be completed in accordance with the City's Policy on Masonry Restoration on Heritage Buildings;
3. Details pertaining to the finalized garage doors (x 2) and entrance door selection for the garage/drive shed shall be provided to Planning staff for review to ensure minimal impact to the heritage attributes of the subject property; and
4. The applicant shall reconstruct and paint the wood eave (soffit and fascia) and dentil frieze board to match the existing eave (soffit and fascia) and dentil frieze board following the removal of the exterior cement block chimney.

Carried

**iii. Subject: Application for Heritage Permit
Address: 45 King Street East (P18-175)
File Number: P18-020-2018**

Ms. Rowse-Thompson provided the Committee with a summary of the Report.

The Chair sought confirmation that the comments submitted via DASH were captured correctly in the report. Members of the Committee confirmed that the submissions were captured correctly.

The Chair afforded members of the public with an opportunity to provide comment.

Mr. Gower suggested that photographs be taken of the property before the work commences.

Mr. Gervan sought further information regarding the brick. The agent provided the Committee with additional information regarding the design of the brick.

Moved by Ms. Hyett
Seconded by Mr. Taylor

That Heritage Kingston supports Council's approval of the following:

That alterations to the property at 45 King Street East, be approved in accordance with the details described in the application (File Number P18-020-2018), which was deemed complete on April 5, 2018, with said removal of the existing concrete brick chimneys on the east and west elevations and the building of two new double-flue brick chimneys with stone or cast concrete caps in a historically appropriate design; and

That the approval of the alterations be subject to the following conditions:

1. All masonry works shall be completed in accordance with the City's Policy on Masonry Restoration on Heritage Buildings.

Carried

**iv. Subject: Application for Heritage Permit
Address: 92 Sydenham Street (P18-365)
File Number: P18-026-2018**

Mr. Gervan withdrew from the meeting.

Mr. Leary provided the Committee with a summary of the Report.

The Chair sought confirmation that the comments submitted via DASH were captured correctly in the report. Members of the Committee confirmed that the submissions were captured correctly.

The Chair afforded members of the public with an opportunity to provide comment.

Members of the public did not provide comment.

Mr. Taylor expressed concern that some aspects of the application may not meet the Ontario Building Code. Mr. Newman replied that staff will ensure that the application conforms to the Ontario Building Code.

Moved by Mr. Taylor
Seconded by Ms. Hyett

That Heritage Kingston supports Council's approval of the following:

That alterations to the property at 92 Sydenham Street, be approved in accordance with the details described in the application (File Number P18-026-2018), which was deemed complete on April 17, 2018, with said alterations to include landscaping, and the removal and reconstruction of the front staircase; and

That the approval of the alterations be subject to the following conditions:

1. A Building Permit shall be obtained;
2. All masonry works shall be completed in accordance with the City's Policy on Masonry Restoration on Heritage Buildings;
3. Consideration shall be given to repairing the window below the staircase, through a further *Heritage Act* application;
4. Underground utility locates shall be obtained prior to excavation; and
5. An Encroachment Permit shall be obtained, as necessary.

Carried

Mr. Gervan returned to the meeting.

- v. **Subject: Application for Heritage Permit**
Address: 79 William Street (P18-951)
File Number: P18-025-2018

Mr. Leary provided the Committee with an overview of the Report.

The Chair afforded members of the public with an opportunity to provide comment.

Members of the public did not provide comment.

Mr. Gervan sought further information regarding the shingles. The applicant provided additional information regarding the design of the shingles.

Mr. Taylor suggested that the word "should" be replaced with "shall" in clause "7." of the recommendation.

Moved by Mr. Gervan
Seconded by Mr. Taylor

That Heritage Kingston supports Council's approval of the following:

That alterations to the property at 79 William Street, be approved in accordance with the details described in the application (File Number P18-025-2018), which was deemed

complete on April 5, 2018, with said replacement of the existing asphalt shingles with dark brown metal shingles; replacement of the sheet metal roofing on the eyebrow dormers with dark brown metal sheeting; replacement of the eaves troughs and downspouts with new metal eaves troughs and downspouts in a dark brown colour; restoration of the single pane wood windows in eyebrow dormers or replacement with new double glazed units to match existing detail (wood or metal clad wood); insertion of a new skylight window on the west facing roof; construction of a new hip dormer on the rear elevation; repair of brick lintels; and replacement of wood shingles where required; and

That the approval of the alterations be subject to the following conditions:

1. A Building Permit shall be obtained, including confirmation of zoning compliance;
2. All masonry works shall be completed in accordance with the City's Policy on Masonry Restoration on Heritage Buildings;
3. All window repairs and/or replacements shall be completed in accordance with the City's Policy on Window Renovations in Heritage Buildings;
4. Details pertaining to the finalized proposal (repair or replacement) for the eyebrow dormer windows shall be provided to Planning staff for review to ensure minimal impact to the heritage attributes of the Old Sydenham Heritage Conservation District;
5. Details pertaining to the finalized proposal for the metal roof shingles and selected metal roofing (sheet or shingles) for the eyebrow dormers shall be provided to Planning staff for review to ensure minimal impact to the heritage attributes of the Old Sydenham Heritage Conservation District;
6. Details pertaining to the finalized proposal for the skylight shall be provided to Planning staff for review to ensure minimal impact to the heritage attributes of the Old Sydenham Heritage Conservation District; and
7. Planning staff shall be circulated the drawings and design specifications, tied to the Building Permit application, for review and approval to ensure consistency with the scope of the Heritage Permit sought by this application.

Carried

**vi. Subject: Notice of Intention to Designate under the *Ontario Heritage Act*
Addresses: 3012 Creekford Road (P18-1297)
File Numbers: R01-006-2018**

Mr. Leary provided the Committee with an overview of the Report.

The Chair afforded members of the public with an opportunity to provide comment.

Members of the public did not provide comment.

Moved by Mr. Taylor
Seconded by Ms. McFarlane

That Council serve a Notice of Intention to Designate the property located at 3012 Creekford Road, known as the Zachariah David Farmhouse, as a property of cultural heritage value or interest pursuant to Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, attached as Exhibit A to Report Number HK-18-031; and

That should no Notice of Objection be received by the Clerk of The Corporation of the City of Kingston within thirty (30) days of the publication of the Notice of Intention to Designate, that Council approve the Draft Designation By-Law for 3012 Creekford Road, attached as Exhibit B to Report Number HK-18-031 and carry out the requirements as prescribed under Section 29(6) of the Act.

Carried

**vii. Subject: Heritage Pre-Consultation Application
Address: 81-83 King Street East (P18-178)
File Number: F32-016-2018**

Mr. Leary introduced the proposed plans for 81-83 King Street East.

The agent spoke to the Committee regarding the proposed plans. The agent provided committee members with a document regarding the proposal. A copy of the document is attached to the original set of minutes located in the City Clerk's Department.

Mr. Newman provided the Committee with additional background information regarding the file.

Mr. Taylor noted that the proposal does change the massing of the structure and commented that his initial reaction is that the adjustment is okay as the majority of the changes are below the roofline.

Councillor Stroud encouraged Committee members to submit comments regarding the proposal via DASH. Ms. Agnew noted that staff would like to receive as much technical feedback as possible from the Committee. She indicated that staff would be happy to meet with individual committee members. Councillor Stroud requested that Committee members provide feedback as quickly as possible.

Ms. Hyett withdrew from the meeting at 12:04 p.m.

Ms. McFarlane expressed concern that the proposed pool would not comply with setback requirements

Mr. Gervan commented that the proposal is exciting. He stated that he is pleased that the property is being returned to a single family home.

Mr. Gervan withdrew from the meeting.

The Committee meeting concluded at 12:07 p.m. due to a lack of quorum.