



**City of Kingston
Report to Council
Report Number 19-010**

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Jim Keech, President & CEO, Utilities Kingston
Resource Staff: Sheila Kidd, Deputy Commissioner Operations - Transportation and Infrastructure Services
Date of Meeting: December 18, 2018
Subject: Award of Contract – Certified Forestry Technician Services

Executive Summary:

In 2014, the City of Kingston developed an emerald ash borer (EAB) plan to deal with the presence of the emerald ash borer invasive beetle. The plan is a working document that provides options for managing the public ash tree inventory and the cost impacts associated with an EAB invasion. Components of the plan include, but are not limited to, ash tree treatments, stump removals, and new tree planting. The services of a certified forestry technician are required to assist staff with the planning and contract management of the EAB mitigation plan.

The term of this contract, including the optional renewal year, aligns with the formal conclusion of the EAB plan where further analysis and planning will occur.

In October 2018, Public Works issued RFP F31-TIS-PW-2018-11, Certified Forestry Technician Services. Only two submissions to the RFP were received and staff is not recommending the lowest bid, therefore Council approval is required to proceed with the purchase.

It is recommended that the contract be awarded to the highest scoring proponent based on the evaluation criteria as set out in the Request for Proposal (RFP) document. The proposal from Davey Resource Group is the highest ranked proposal.

Recommendation:

That Council authorize the Mayor and the City Clerk to execute a contract for Certified Forestry Technician Services, pursuant to RFP F31-TIS-PW-2018-1, with Davey Resource Group, for a 12-month period effective January 1, 2019 with an option to renew for one additional 12-month period, at the sole discretion of the City of Kingston, in a form satisfactory to the Director of Legal Services.

December 18, 2018

Page 2 of 5

Authorizing Signatures:

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY PRESIDENT & CEO, UTILITIES KINGSTON

**Jim Keech, President & CEO,
Utilities Kingston**

ORIGINAL SIGNED BY CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER

Gerard Hunt, Chief Administrative Officer

Consultation with the following Members of the Corporate Management Team:

Lanie Hurdle, Commissioner, Community Services	Not required
Desirée Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer	Not required
Denis Leger, Commissioner, Corporate & Emergency Services	Not required

December 18, 2018

Page 3 of 5

Options/Discussion:

In 2014, staff developed an Emerald Ash Borer Impact Cost Mitigation Plan to guide the management of EAB impacted ash trees. Since that time, staff has implemented a cycle of tree removals, treatments, and replacements. The plan relies on certified forestry technician services to assist with planning and contract management activities.

On November 14, 2018, two Request for Proposal (RFP) submissions were received for RFP F31-TIS-PW-2018-11 Certified Forestry Technician Services.

The scope and complexity of the certified forestry technician services was clearly described in the RFP. Both proposals were reviewed by staff and evaluated based on the criteria set out in the RFP, as indicated in the table below. The weighting for the financial component of the RFP was determined to be 55% and is within the range of 25% - 75% as prescribed within the City's purchasing policy. Staff believes that this is an acceptable weighting for the financial component and reflects a reasonable balance between price, experience, qualifications, and proposed work plan.

Evaluation Criteria	Weighting
Stipulated Price	55
Company Profile, Project Reference, and Past Experience	27
Proposed Work Plan and Quality Approach	14
Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act	4
Total	100

Davey Resource Group (Davey) provided a comprehensive and thorough submission in response to the RFP. Davey provided an experienced and qualified team with certifications and training to support the project. A detailed project methodology plan was supplied with required information and tasks to be completed. Davey provided three municipal references with a detailed scope of services. They also provided a detailed accessible customer service standard compliance document in support of this contract to ensure accessibility is achieved through the duration of the project. The proposal provided by Davey represents the best value and qualified personnel for the City of Kingston in completing the requested services. The Davey proposal received a score of 77 out of 100.

The proposal received from Zomer Corporation (Zomer) represented the lowest price of the proposals received however Zomer's submission did not demonstrate relevant municipal forestry technician experience. The experience and certifications of the project team were not well detailed for this service. The project methodology plan failed to provide details on the planning and execution of the detailed aspects of the project. As a result, key delivery dates were not defined as requested in the RFP document, resulting in a lower overall score even though their proposed price was lower.

December 18, 2018

Page 4 of 5

The table below provides final scores of the submissions from the proponents including both qualification and price.

Proponent	Rank (using criteria in RFP)	Total Score	Bid Price Submitted Per Hour (HST excluded)
Davey Resource Group	1	77	\$73.90
Zomer Corporation	2	65	\$47.98

Davey Resource Group has successfully fulfilled all requirements of the previous two contracts for the certified forestry technician services to the satisfaction of Public Works. The table below indicates the hourly rate for the previous contract as well as the proposed hourly rates for the 2019/2020 services.

Year	Price Per Hour
2015 / 2016	\$73.79
2017 / 2018	\$72.81
2019	\$73.90
2020	\$75.75

The contract hours for this service have a set minimum of 1,000 hours and a maximum of 2,000 hours per year.

Existing Policy/By-law:

By-Law Number 2000-134, a By-Law to Establish Purchasing Policies and Procedures.

Notice Provisions:

None.

Accessibility Considerations:

Accessibility was one of the criteria used to evaluate the proposals. Davey demonstrated a clear understanding of the current accessibility legislation.

Financial Considerations:

There are adequate funds for this contract in the Public Works capital plan.

December 18, 2018

Page 5 of 5

Contacts:

Bill Linnen, Acting Director, Public Works Department, 613-546-4291, Ext. 1856

Troy Stubinski, Operations Manager, Public Works Department, 613-546-4291, Ext. 2183

Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:

Dan Cuthill, Capital Projects Coordinator, Engineering Department

Exhibits Attached:

None.