



**City of Kingston
Information Report to Council
Report Number 19-299**

To: Mayor and Members of Council
From: Lanie Hurdle, Interim Chief Administrative Officer
Resource Staff: Paige Agnew, Director, Planning, Building & Licensing Services
Date of Meeting: November 19, 2019
Subject: Supplementary Report - Reporting on Results of Ontario Regulation 9/06 Review & Heritage Easement Agreement under the *Ontario Heritage Act* (Report Number HK-19-038)
Address: 90-92 Barrack Street (P18-1405)
File Number: F32-045-2019

Executive Summary:

The purpose of this supplementary report is to provide Council with two stone masons' estimates related to the restoration of a stone wall at the rear of the property municipally addressed as 90-92 Barrack Street. These cost estimates were obtained in response to Council's September 3rd motion of deferral on Heritage Kingston's negative recommendation.

On August 21, 2019, Heritage Kingston voted against staff's recommendation to enter into a heritage easement agreement with the owners of the stone wall. The recommended easement agreement would permit partial demolition of the wall. The agreement would also provide a clear framework for the retention of the east and west ends of the wall, and ensure that additional mitigating measures were put in place to conserve the heritage value of the wall. The recommendation was based on a number of factors outlined in staff's original report, including a cost estimate for the restoration of the wall, provided by a third party professional engineer ([Report Number HK-19-038](#)). Heritage Kingston members indicated they were not comfortable supporting the recommendation, as a stone mason's quote should also be obtained related to various approaches for restoration of the wall.

Council's deferral motion was intended to allow staff time to obtain a cost estimate from a stone mason. This supplementary report provides such information. Staff continue to recommend that

November 19, 2019

Page 2 of 6

Council approve the by-law to enact a heritage easement agreement under Section 37(1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* for the property municipally known as 90-92 Barrack Street.

Recommendation:

This report is for information purposes only.

November 19, 2019

Page 3 of 6

Authorizing Signatures:

**Lanie Hurdle, Interim Chief
Administrative Officer**

Consultation with the following Members of the Corporate Management Team:

Peter Huigenbos, Acting Commissioner, Community Services	Not required
Brad Joyce, Acting Commissioner, Corporate Services	Not required
Jim Keech, President & CEO, Utilities Kingston	Not required
Desirée Kennedy, Chief Financial Officer & City Treasurer	Not required
Sheila Kidd, Commissioner, Transportation & Public Works	Not required

November 19, 2019

Page 4 of 6

Options/Discussion:**Masons' Cost Estimates**

Staff contacted eight stone masons to request cost estimates for the restoration and partial demolition of the wall. Four of these stone masons were located within the Kingston area, and are those masons known to be commonly involved in heritage restoration projects throughout the city. These include Enoch's Hammer, Edgewater Stonemasons, Upper Canada Stone House Group and Santin Masonry. These masons were contacted by email on September 9, 2019. Understanding that fall is an extremely busy time of year for stone masons, staff also followed up via email on September 20, 2019.

Santin Masonry was able to undertake a preliminary assessment and cost estimate for restoration of the wall. It should be noted that this estimate was provided based on an initial review. Any future works would require additional assessment and quote based on a firm scope of work. Santin Masonry noted that the wall is in "very poor" condition and would require rebuilding if retained. The estimated costs provided were as follows:

- Dismantle and complete rebuild in place: \$220,000
- Dismantle and rebuild each end at a height of 12 feet (as proposed in the recommended heritage easement agreement): \$85,000
- Dismantle and rebuild the wall at a height of 6 feet: \$120,000

Other masons contacted within Kingston were unable to provide a cost estimate related to the stone wall.

In an effort to provide at least two estimates to Council for consideration, staff contacted a municipal heritage planner in Ottawa to obtain recommendations for stone masons in that market. Staff contacted four masons in the Ottawa area via email on October 1, 2019. M.H. Stoneworks Inc., who have completed masonry restoration works at Parliament Hill and Queen's Gate, were able to submit an estimate to staff based on the information and photographs provided via email.

It should be noted that M.H. Masonry did not undertake a site visit to evaluate the wall. Any future works would require additional on-site assessment before a fixed quote could be provided. M.H. Stoneworks estimated that a full retention of the stone wall would cost approximately \$150,000 to \$175,000. The mason was not able to provide an estimate for retention of the end portions of the wall, but confirmed that the estimate of \$85,000 provided by Santin Masonry seemed reasonable for the scope of work.

Engineer's Cost Estimate Review

As noted in staff's original report, Roney Engineering provided estimates for restoration and partial demolition of both the wall at 90-92 Barrack Street, and the abutting wall along the eastern property line of 85 Queen Street. As such, the estimates in the professional engineer's report for complete restoration are high in comparison to those provided by the stone masons.

November 19, 2019

Page 5 of 6

Heritage Kingston members commented that clarity in this regard would be helpful in the review of the heritage easement recommendation.

Staff have since confirmed with Roney Engineering that the costs for restoration works on the wall at 90-92 Barrack Street would be approximately one-half to two-thirds of the total costs provided in the professional engineer's report. Roney Engineering noted that there were base costs for mobilization of work that would apply regardless of the length of wall being worked on. Labour and material costs would vary depending on the amount of work completed. It is noted that the subject wall at 90-92 Barrack Street is 20.1 metres, while the wall on the Queen Street property is 10.95 metres.

Based on this understanding, the comparative engineering estimate for dismantling and rebuilding the wall in place is between \$248,000 and \$327,000.

Conclusion

Costs provided by heritage stone masons, as outlined above, are intended to assist Council in their review of staff's recommendation and Heritage Kingston's vote of non-support. As provided in this supplementary report, there is some variation in cost estimates for complete restoration of the wall. The estimates for a full retention of the wall range from \$150,000 to \$327,000. There is general consistency in cost estimates for the scope of work outlined in the recommended heritage easement, in the range of \$81,000 to \$85,000 (Exhibit A - Estimates from Stone Masons).

Staff continue to recommend that Council approve the by-law to enact a heritage easement agreement for the subject property in accordance with Section 37(1) of the Act. The property owner is agreeable to the recommended easement agreement, as proposed. The agreement is intended to provide a clear framework for partial demolition of the wall, while requiring a number of interventions to conserve its heritage value (i.e., interpretive panel, reuse of viable stones, retention of end segments at full height). The easement agreement will also provide heritage protection of the retained portions of the wall into the future.

Existing Policy/By-Law:

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada (Parks Canada)
Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. O.18. (Province of Ontario)
Ontario Regulation 9/06 - Criteria for Determining Cultural Heritage Value or Interest
Provincial Policy Statement
City of Kingston Official Plan

Notice Provisions:

Not applicable

Accessibility Considerations:

Not applicable

November 19, 2019

Page 6 of 6

Financial Considerations:

Not applicable

Contacts:

Andrea Gummo, Acting Manager, Policy Planning 613-546-4291 extension 3256

Genise Grant, Intermediate Planner 613-546-4291 extension 3185

Other City of Kingston Staff Consulted:

The application was circulated internally for review and all comments have been incorporated in staff's original report and recommendation.

Exhibits Attached:

Exhibit A Estimates from Stone Masons

From: David [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, October 14, 2019 12:47 PM
To: Grant,Genise
Cc: Gummo,Andrea
Subject: Re: City of Kingston - Estimate Required - Masonry Wall

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Completed

Hello Genise,

The budget costs, based on the images provided, for 'D' wall section would be between \$150 – 175 K.
I hope this helps.
Thanks,

David Watson
President,
Modern Hieroglyphics Inc.
o/a M H Stoneworks
M H Stoneworks
Ph: 613-692-0405
Cell: 613-282-1233
Fax: 613-692-4463

From: "Grant,Genise" <ggrant@cityofkingston.ca>
Date: Tuesday, October 1, 2019 at 2:18 PM
Cc: "Gummo,Andrea" <agummo@cityofkingston.ca>
Subject: City of Kingston - Estimate Required - Masonry Wall

Hello,

Based on a request from our Council, City of Kingston Heritage Staff are looking to obtain cost estimates from masons for the restoration of a heritage stone wall in the city. Given the time of year and workload of local stone masons in Kingston, Staff are looking to reputable masons who are known to do work in nearby cities. You have been recommended as a contact.

The stone wall in question is located on private property. As such, the estimate is requested for informational purposes only to inform a Council decision related to a potential heritage easement agreement. Unfortunately, Staff do not have a budget for this work, but are hopeful you may be in the Kingston area in the near future and able to undertake a preliminary assessment of the wall. Any subsequent works undertaken on the wall would be the responsibility of the property owner.

The wall is located in the City block between Queen and Barrack Streets, west of Wellington Street (see rough map and pictures, attached). The City is looking for quotes related to the following options:

- Restoring the stone wall in its entirety (either in-place or rebuilding, as deemed necessary);
- Restoring the wall to a shorter height across its breadth (e.g., to six feet, to four feet); and
- Partial demolition of the wall as illustrated in "Exhibit F", attached.

For background, City Staff recently made a recommendation to our municipal heritage committee to enter into a heritage easement agreement with the owners of the masonry wall. The easement agreement would effectively permit partial demolition of the wall, with a retention of two end segments at the wall's original height. Staff had previously obtained an assessment and cost estimates from a third party Engineer to inform the recommendation. The heritage committee voted not to support Staff's recommendation for partial demolition on the basis that a mason's estimate should also be provided for works on the wall before a decision can be made. For more information, please see Staff's report to Council, [here](#).

Please let me know, by way of response to this email, if you would be interested and available to provide an estimate as outlined above. I'm happy to answer any questions or discuss further, and can be reached by email at ggrant@cityofkingston.ca or by phone at 613-546-4291 ext. 3185.

Thanks and all the best,
Genise



Genise Grant, MPI.

Intermediate Planner
Planning, Building & Licensing Services

City of Kingston
1211 John Counter Boulevard,
216 Ontario Street Kingston, ON K7L 2Z3
613-546-4291 ext. 3185
ggrant@cityofkingston.ca



This E-mail contains confidential information intended only for the individual or entity named in the message. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or the agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any review, dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is prohibited. If this communication was received in error, or if you wish to stop receiving communications from the City of Kingston, please notify us by reply E-mail and delete the original message.

From: m.morey [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, September 23, 2019 11:56 AM
To: Grant,Genise
Cc: Leary,Ryan; Gummo,Andrea
Subject: Re: Restoration Quote - Masonry Wall - Barrack Street

Genise,

The wall is in very poor condition and would require rebuilding for the most part. Some may be able to be saved but we wouldn't know until we started into the work. That being said I've allowed worse case scenario. All the budget numbers below would include proper reinforcing similar to what we are doing for DND at Fort Frontenac wall.

To dismantle and rebuild completely you'd be looking at approximately \$220,000.

Dismantle and rebuilding only 12' at each end: \$85,000.

Dismantle and rebuild 6' height for the length of the wall: \$120,000.

These are budget numbers from a quick review of the wall. If we were to proceed with any work at all we would quote according to the scope identified.

Thanks and let me know if you have any questions.

Matt Morey, C.E.T.

Project Manager

A. Santin Mason Contractor Ltd.

Cell [613] [453 7013](tel:4537013)

On Sep 9, 2019, at 3:47 PM, Grant,Genise <ggrant@cityofkingston.ca> wrote:

Hello,

Heritage Staff are reaching out to a number of local stone masons who we have known to do good work on heritage buildings and structures around Kingston. We are looking for estimates for restoration of a stone wall in the City block between Queen and Barrack Streets, west of Wellington Street (see rough map and pictures, attached). We would be looking for quotes related to the following options:

- Restoring the stone wall in its entirety (either in-place or rebuilding, as deemed necessary);
- Restoring the wall to a shorter height across its breadth (e.g., to six feet, to four feet); and
- Partial demolition of the wall as illustrated in "Exhibit F", attached.

For background, as you may have been following, Staff recently made a recommendation to Heritage Kingston and Council to enter into a heritage easement

agreement with the owners of the masonry wall. The easement agreement would effectively permit partial demolition of the wall, with a retention of two end segments at the wall's original height. Staff had previously obtained an assessment and cost estimates from an engineer to inform the recommended agreement. Heritage Kingston voted not to support Staff's recommendation for partial demolition, on the basis that a mason's estimate should also be provided for works on the wall before a decision can be made. For more information, please see Staff's report to Council, [here](#).

Please let me know, by way of response to this email, if you would be interested and available in the next three weeks to provide an estimate as outlined above. I'm happy to answer any questions or discuss further, and can be reached by phone at 613-546-4291 ext. 3185.

Thanks and all the best,
Genise

<image001.png>

Genise Grant, MPI.

Intermediate Planner
Planning, Building & Licensing Services

<image002.png> <image003.png> <image004.png>

City of Kingston
1211 John Counter Boulevard,
216 Ontario Street Kingston, ON K7L 2Z3
613-546-4291 ext. 3185
ggrant@cityofkingston.ca

This E-mail contains confidential information intended only for the individual or entity named in the message. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or the agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any review, dissemination, distribution or copying of this communication is prohibited. If this communication was received in error, or if you wish to stop receiving communications from the City of Kingston, please notify us by reply E-mail and delete the original message.

<Context Photographs-.pdf>

<Approximate Location of Wall.pdf>

<Exhibit F - Scope of Work Illustration.pdf>